Implementation of inclusive education as experienced by immigrant learners of diverse backgrounds in South Africa

Zonke Ngema (iD) **and Antoinette D'amant** (iD)
School of Education, College of Humanities, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban, South Africa
zonkengema85@gmail.com

The rise in global migration means that immigrant learners have become an integral part of the South African schooling system. Educational transformation in South Africa has made diversity in schools a norm, with many schools having varied learners in terms of race, language, ethnicity, religion and culture. The move towards inclusive education should guarantee all learners, irrespective of their background, quality education. In this article I document the journey of immigrant learners in the context of South African schooling considering how inclusive their schooling experiences have been. The research was conducted at 2 primary schools (1 private and 1 public) in Durban using a qualitative, interpretive paradigm, narrative inquiry, a visual method, and semi-structured interviews to generate participants' narratives. The findings highlight the pressure experienced in the face of prejudice, discrimination and antagonism from local peers and teachers, which impeded immigrant learners' adaptation and success. The research also highlights the language barrier for those participants with limited proficiency in English. While the resilience of the immigrant learners is foregrounded, the findings highlight that inclusive education is not a reality for all schools in South Africa.

Keywords: immigrant learners; inclusive education; learner diversity

Background and Introduction

Extraordinary changes in international migration during recent times has transformed human mobility into a major global issue, with some considering it to be the defining issue of the 21st century (Betts, 2015). Research by Whitaker (2017) suggests that the world is indeed on the move and because of growing human mobility and global migration, schools are currently faced with the challenge of educating a diverse population (Pinson, Arnott & Candappa, 2010). It is fair to heed the warning that while many education systems strive to provide equal educational opportunities to all learners regardless of their immigration status, socio-economic background, and origin, only a few manage to meet these objectives (Schleicher & Zoido, 2016). Despite the international shift to inclusive education, research has proven that, in most countries, fundamental tensions and contradictions exist between stated policy and actual practice, and that contradictions within a school's culture can occur at all levels.

Immigrant learners have become an important component in South African schools (Osman, 2009) and many academics concur that immigrant learners experience adjustment and adaptation challenges when enrolling at South African schools (Goyol, 2006). Some immigrant learners have the additional challenge of having to attend extra classes to acquire the language used as medium of instruction before joining mainstream classes. South Africa adopted inclusive education as a process to address and respond to the diversity of the needs of all school-going learners and to create a system of schooling that would meet the needs of a democratic society that acknowledges the right to equal and full participation, irrespective of individual differences. This meant that the emphasis shifted away from segregating, dividing practices and excluding learners on the basis of their differences, to ways in which learning environments might better respond to the diversity in school populations (D'amant, 2010).

Against this backdrop, I report on research in which I explored the narrated experiences of immigrant learners in the South African schooling context, in the hope of contributing to a better understanding of how they experience schooling in South African schools and how they navigate their schooling contexts. This study allowed space for immigrant learners to relate their experiences, thereby offering a platform for their voices to be heard. The cornerstone of this study was the active participation of immigrant learners in the construction of their narratives through sharing authentic experiences about their schooling life.

A further and broader aim of this research was to investigate to what extent the ideals of inclusive education were extended to immigrant learners. Kang'ethe and Duma (2013) verified that South Africa is a country with a long history of immigration. And estimated 2.5 million residents were not born in the country, amounting to around 5% of the total population (Ruedin, 2019). In a recent study by International Data Alliance for Children on the Move ([IDAC], 2021) it is estimated that, worldwide, 35.5 million children live outside the country of their birth, making it an issue of global interest and concern.

Therefore, I conducted this study to respond to the following research questions:

- What are the schooling experiences of immigrant learners in South Africa?
- How do these immigrant learners navigate these experiences in a host country?
- To what extent are the ideals of inclusive education a reality for these immigrant learners?

Literature Review

Although Muthukrishna (2010) and Ntombela (2010, 2011) conducted significant research on inclusive education, research on the experiences of immigrant learners in the context of schooling in South Africa and their navigation of successes and challenges in this host country is limited. In the American context, Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2015) revealed that most of the immigrant learners encountered challenges academically; some leaving schools without attaining the tools needed to be effective in an extremely competitive economy. This, in turn, severely limited and obstructed social flexibility. Dusi and Steibach (2016) affirm that immigrant learners face adjustment challenges such as making new friends, acquiring the dominant language of the host country and familiarising themselves with a new system of education. The challenges also include limited communication skills in the official languages of the receiving countries, unfamiliarity with the education system, different educational philosophies and practices, culture, structure and regulations of the new countries, lack of social networks, insufficient access to information and resources and, a lack of confidence in expressing their needs to teachers and authorities (Liu, 2016).

Providing education to immigrant learners is, therefore, of utmost importance – increasingly so given the likelihood of future growth in immigrant flows (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development [OECD], 2016). Many immigrant learners counteract the lack of positive social interaction in schools by building other supportive networks that are more accepting and inclusive outside the schooling context (Ngema, 2014). Elaborating on this, Koehler (2017) suggests that learners with an immigrant background are often more motivated to be successful in their education.

While access to education has largely been realised in South Africa after the implementation of new educational policies, simply integrating, assimilating or absorbing diverse learners into the curriculum as it is, does not guarantee the effectiveness of the educational experience for diverse learners. If learners are simply absorbed into the existing traditional ethos of an institution and expected to fit in and cope as best they can, with little or no conscious effort by the school management or teachers to change or adapt aspects of learning and teaching in a meaningful way to accommodate their individual needs, the moral vision inherent in inclusive education may be severely jeopardised (D'amant, 2010).

Over 20 years following the adoption of White Paper 6 (Department of Education [DoE], 2001), it is concerning that research into inclusion shows that most learners in South Africa are still not effectively accommodated in classrooms and most teachers fall short of offering their learners quality education. With the increasing number of learners of diverse cultures entering schools, learners and teachers alike should be encouraged to develop attributes such as curiosity, open-mindedness, awareness of others, tolerance and having high expectations (OECD, 2017). In addition, schools can be proactive in developing an inclusive school climate, promoting positive relationships among learners and providing a safe environment for all through the transmission of the values of dignity, acceptance, tolerance and the celebration of diversity (OECD, 2018).

The Theoretical Framework

I was drawn to adopting the paradigm in childhood studies referred to as the new sociology of childhood (NSC) with its subfield of children's geographies, to support the theoretical framing of my study. The foundation tenets of new childhood studies influenced my ontological and epistemological stance on children and childhood as I embarked on this study.

The choices were shaped by the assumption that qualitative researchers cannot directly capture the lived experiences of participants and should, therefore, gather and present data in a way that will allow participants to speak for themselves (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). It was a priority in this research endeavour that participants are represented in the most authentic way possible and that methodologies ensured a high degree of participation. The research was participatory in that it was a person-centred inquiry, conducting research with immigrant learners, rather than on them or about them. I encouraged interaction, collaboration and cooperation between myself and those being researched.

The study was aligned to the new epistemology inherent in new childhood studies and children's geographies – a view of knowledge that does not privilege traditional research-based theory and techniques but instead supports immigrant learners to claim legitimacy of their own investigations, and that would value the kind of knowledge they offered and the narrative data they generated. New childhood studies provided a suitable theoretical lens for this study as from this perspective, immigrant learners were viewed as capable of explaining their own reality and were seen as competent individuals. This research provided a platform that enabled these learners to share their own valuable insights, perspectives and stories, which were thought worthy of being researched and appreciated (Punch & Tisdall, 2012).

According to Begeny and Martens (2007), inclusion in education means the inclusion of all learners, regardless of their background and capabilities, in education that meets their distinctive needs. Inclusive education is grounded

in philosophies of equality and fairness (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization [UNESCO], 2015), thereby challenging any practices that support exclusion and marginalisation (Preece, 2006). Inclusive education adheres to the principle that each learner should take part equitably in the school community and should be appreciated for their uniqueness (Causton-Theoharis & Theoharis, 2008).

An inclusive culture is regarded as a means of minimising social inequalities and of promoting conscientiousness and responsibility in living and working towards setting up and keeping democratic values in society (Shaddock, Nielsen, Giorcelli, Kilham & Hoffman-Raap, 2007). According to the South African White Paper, (DoE, 2001) and the World Education Forum (UNESCO, 2015), inclusive education can be defined as a schooling system based on the belief that all learners have an undisputed right to education and on the principle that education can be a weapon against social inequality (Preece, 2006). Inclusive education has its roots in social justice (Morcom & MacCallum, 2012) – the key premise being that schools should provide quality education to all learners regardless of differences in race, class, culture, language, gender, ethnicity or ability/disability. Teachers are, therefore, encouraged to respond to individual differences, including the cultural, linguistic, cognitive, physical, emotional or social needs of all learners (Voltz, Sims & Nelson, 2010).

An inclusive, democratic pedagogy is grounded in the politics of ethics, difference and democracy and suggests the recognition and acknowledgement of diversity, respect for differences and the right to experience a sense of belonging and active participation in all aspects of society without having to give up or deny one's unique identity (Schmidt & Mestry, 2019). It is expected that inclusive school policies and practices should focus on how schools support and respect diversity rather than to suppress and deny it as well as how all learners are provided with learning opportunities to achieve their full potential, regardless of their diversity (United Nations Children's Fund [UNICEF], 2012). Ainscow (2019) and Koehler and Schneider (2019) confirm that there is an urgent need to include immigrant learners in the education system and to ensure that they are not discriminated against or excluded.

Methodology
The research methodology included a qualitative, interpretivist research design in which narrative inquiry, visual methodologies and conversational interviews to generate rich, authentic narrative data were employed. According to Merriam (2009), researchers conducting qualitative research are largely interested in how people interpret their experiences, how they construct their worlds and, what meaning they attribute to their experiences. McMillan and Schumacher (2010) describe qualitative research as richly descriptive accounts of naturally occurring phenomena using words and narrative telling, rather than through numbers and measurements. Qualitative, interpretive research was chosen because of the commitment to study the world from the perspective of the interacting individual (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994) with a focus on understanding immigrant learners' experiences from their own perspectives and the meanings that they attach to these, and the way in which they make sense of them (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994; Merriam, 1998). Schwandt (1994:118) explains that an interpretive approach offers deep insight into "the complex world of lived experience from the point of view of those who live it." Furthermore, research by Clandinin (2006, 2007, 2013) states that narrative inquiry is a way of understanding experience and an effective way to research participants' experiences to understand them. By using narrative inquiry, I invited individuals to tell their stories and present them using a framework of temporality, sociality and spatiality, to allow a deeper understanding of their experience (Clandinin, 2006, 2007, 2013). Narrative inquiry is a process that can expand understanding of the complex ways in which humans understand their experiences and reality. The strength of narrative inquiry as a choice for this research lies in accessing a deeper understanding of the participants' different social constructions of reality through the stories they tell. Narrative enquiry provides significant data to answer important research questions meaningfully (Berry, 2016).

A combination of visual methodologies in the form of collage exercises and individual, semi-structured interviews was used to generate data. I employed qualitative content data analysis (Mayring, 2000) during which open coding was used to condense the narrative data into themes and emerging patterns and the categorisation of these accordingly (Merriam, 2009).

The guidelines to the participants on the creation of their collages were to find images and pictures representing their interests before and after they came to South Africa and to add any aspects of who they were at the time and what has affected them in their schooling and everyday life since coming to this country; how moving to this country had influenced them or changed them and their daily experiences. During the semi-structured interviews the participants' collages were used as point of departure for informal conversation to flow naturally and in a non-threatening manner. The interviews were adaptable and flexible (Verma & Mallick, 1999), taking the form of an organic, flowing conversation.

Open-ended questions about their collages were used as prompts to encourage authentic, rich responses from the participants. In creating their collages, the participants were engaged in making sense of their schooling experiences as immigrant learners and reflecting on their own authentic interpretations of these. They were necessarily involved in thinking about themselves and their schooling lives as immigrant learners, what their experiences were and how they positioned themselves on their personal and academic journeys. Evidence by Spencer (2011) shows that visuals have the potential to provide deeper as well as subtle explanations of how social context and relationships are recognised, allowing us to see daily experiences with new eyes. Furthermore, Kenny (2009) stipulates that visual exercises may aid learners who have conceptual or linguistic difficulties in expressing themselves orally.

The research was conducted at two schools in Durban, in the province of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. The schools were chosen because many international and African immigrant learners formed part of their learner population. One school was a private school, well-resourced and situated in an area of the city that had many activities with which to integrate the research. It also offered various sports activities to all learners. The other school was a public school that had insufficient resources provided by the government.

The sample included 10 immigrant learners (three girls and seven boys between the ages of 11 and 17) who came from different countries (including Türkiye, the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), Burundi, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, India, England, Australia, Somalia & Rwanda). Although the intention was to generate data from as wide a spectrum of immigrant learners as possible, the sample was ultimately determined by those parents who allowed their children to participate in the study. It became clear through the process of selecting a sample that many immigrant parents were fearful about the security of their children and did not want to draw undue attention to their children by participating in anything more than their academic schooling. Parents viewed girls to be more vulnerable than boys, which is the reason why fewer girls than boys were included in the sample.

Findings: Immigrant Learners' Experiences of Diverse Culture in South Africa

Excerpts from the participants' narratives clearly show that they had experienced some form of "othering" and xenophobia from local South African learners in their host school and even outside the school, in the wider community. As a result of these negative attitudes and behaviour towards them, they felt elements of distress, isolation and exclusion. It is clear from the findings that immigrant learners endure various challenges and adjustments as they try to make sense of how they fit in and find a sense of belonging and acceptance in a foreign country. Experiencing rejection, isolation, harassment and often violence, undoubtedly made their adjustment process more difficult and challenging.

The findings reveal that most immigrant learners had fled their country of origin because of political conflicts and wars and had lost members of their families as they fled from the threat of violence and persecution.

> *There were wars in Burundi, and I fled the country. I came by myself in this country ... my parents and my siblings I do not know. I ... do not know if they are ... dead or not. There were fighting in Burundi ... (pause) ... we ran away. I did not even say goodbye ... to people I know. One day I will go ... back to my country ... to look for them. Here the other learners were passing remarks about the colour of my skin, they made me feel unwelcomed ... the remarks they said to me.* (Participant [P]1)

Being separated from their families, not knowing the whereabouts of some family members nor whether they had survived the war or not and not being able to say goodbye, was understandably an unhappy, traumatic experience for immigrant learners. It is no wonder that these participants did not necessarily view the move to South Africa as entirely positive.

> *Being a foreigner in this ... country is not good because you always fear for your life. Even at school, people ... will look at me and say things I ... do not understand. I was really scared* (P2).
>
> *Coming to this ... country had not been easy at all. I had ... learned many things and my normal life changed ... drastically. I had to get used to ... fetch the bus and ... learners at school have ... attitudes. The other children go in groups ... and even if it is breaking time and passes remarks ... when you are a foreigner. The children here are ... so mean.* (P7)

While there was hope for a better life and survival in South Africa, this move often happened suddenly – with little planning and at great expense: "*I came to South Africa ... because my father was offered a job here; he wants a better life for us*" (P5).

Participants also reported being emotionally stressed by the language barrier because they did not understand what was being said by local learners and teachers and they in turn, could not make themselves understood. This resulted in them being silent for much of the time and only communicating with others who could speak their home language, thereby limiting their chances of making new friends in their host school and achieving academic success.

> *When we are in ... class, teachers do not trust us with ... tasks as they believe are ... cannot get it right because ... of the language barrier* (P3).
>
> *How was I going ... to make friends if I do not know the language? My concern ... was that the girls also say something bad to me although ... I*

did not know what they said ... But I felt it was a terrible thing ... (Pausing). (P8)

It wasn't .... easy cause ... err we did not know English. When I try to talk to a few children ... (looking sad) ..., they start to laugh at me ... and that makes me feel uneasy and unhappy. (P2)

Several studies (Crul, Lelie, Keskiner, Schneider & Biner, 2019; OECD, 2018) conclude that language barriers demotivate non-native learners, hampering their educational trajectories and increasing the risk of discrimination, bullying, and low self-esteem, which negatively influence learning outcomes. In South Africa, these challenges include difficulty in accessing school because of education policies (Meda, Sookrajh & Maharaj, 2012:S160). Other research indicates that when learners do not feel confident in English, they are likely to shy away from participation in class because they feel apprehensive and worry that they might not say the words correctly (Teaching for All, 2019:62).

The findings reveal that immigrant learners from non-African countries, who were first, second and third language speakers of English, experienced fewer challenges in adapting to education in South Africa, with these learners seldom failing a schooling year. This undoubtedly adds to the importance of language in learning and teaching: "*I don't have any problem ... with the medium of instruction used at ... school as we talk English and ... French at home*" (P5).

Having the ability to speak the language of teaching and learning is an indicator of success in the academic journey of immigrant learners. This supports the view that the language of instruction plays an essential role in easing learning of content and in teaching the subject (Ibrahim, Shafaatu & Yabo, 2017). One of the participants described the journey navigating the South Africa education system as follows:

Coming to this country ... had not been easy at all. I had ... to learn many things and my normal life change drastically. I had to get used to ... fetch the bus ... the learners at ... school have attitudes. They go in groups ... even if it is breaking time and ... pass remarks when you are a foreigner. The children here are ... so mean but not all of them. I have learned to defend ... my ... myself as I was once attacked because I refused to pass ... a project to the child ... who called me 'kwerekwere' (foreigner). The project was next to me in class. (P7)

Certain qualities always qualify a person to be "in" (accepted) or "out" (rejected, excluded and isolated) in any community or society. The language issue remains a huge barrier for immigrant learners who want to have access to quality education (Crush & Tawodzera, 2014):

I was ... refused in several schools ... because I did not know any language ... of South Africa. I stayed at home and attended ... English class. After some time later ... the ... they accepted me at school. (P2)

The seven immigrant learner participants who were from African countries reported that it was not easy to make friends as they were from diverse cultural backgrounds and experienced discrimination and belittling from learners, especially in the public school. Positive interaction with learners from other cultural backgrounds seemed to have played an influential role in the immigrant learner participants' continued growth in confidence, despite being different. Many participants reported that communicating with local learners helped them to overcome shyness and to develop a positive outlook on their schoolwork:

We ... share our cultures during Heritage Day ... and it's when we learn ... more about their culture. Amazing friendships developed as we ... share our cultural stories and activities.... We are reminded that ... we are unique and special in ... our own way. (P6)

This finding points to the importance of making friends despite cultural, ethnic and nationality differences and the resulting feelings of confidence in who they are as they are accepted by local learners, and a sense of belonging, regardless of being in a host country different from their home country.

I ... mm ... study hard and excel in sports ... and in class. I have received several ... medals and certificates. I am also ... a head girl, I want my country ... family to be proud of me. Won't allow failure ... in anything I do. I am a girl from ... Congo. (P4)

The above verbatim comment shows that participation in sports and being part of sports teams helped greatly in the process of making friends, both with local South African learners and immigrant learners from other countries. Again, this point emphasises the importance of resilience and finding a place of acceptance and a sense of belonging within their host school.

The findings reveal that immigrant learners who attended the private host school did not seem to experience as much "othering" and negativity as the immigrant learners at the public host school.

At school we are ... exposed to different ... culture from different learners. Every year we have exchange students ... who stay for 5 to 6 weeks. We meet and learn ... from each other (P5).

We are all respecting ... and accepting one another (P10).

Those attending the private school were taught that upholding inclusive values and fighting against injustices in the community were everyone's responsibility in the country and the school took an active stance against any form of prejudice and discrimination. This finding reveals that learners in general can be encouraged to protect immigrant learners from experiencing the negative results of prejudice, discrimination and othering.

Today, inclusive education is generally viewed as a matter of adopting a socio-ecological approach regarding the interactions between

students' capabilities and environmental demands, stressing that educational systems must adapt to and reach all students – and not vice versa (Amor, Hagiwara, Shogren, Thompson, Verdugo, Burke & Aguayo, 2019). However, research has shown that there are not enough resources, especially in public schools, to accommodate the diverse learners attending these schools (Hummel & Engelbrecht, 2018).

Research reports that learning materials and technical equipment are scarce and that overcrowded classrooms have resulted in teachers having to face large student cohorts. This state of affairs results in questionable quality of teaching and learning in general, inequality, fragmentation and a lack of relevance to learners who are othered (Kamanga, 2013). Schools across the world are more diverse today than ever before (Banks, 2008). Research has shown that when faced with difference, whether it be nationality, ethnicity, skin colour or language, it is human nature to feel threatened and to act upon these fears in complex and often negative ways (Hemson, 2011; Nnadozie, 2010; Osman, 2009). Perumal (2015) shows that children value being accepted, recognised and treated with respect and dignity and that this has a positive impact on their academic journey in any situation: "*When we are in ... class teachers do not trust us with ... tasks as they believe we cannot ... get it right because ... of the language barrier*" (P3).

Even in contexts where multilingualism is the norm, classrooms with highly diverse learners are still regarded as a challenge that is not always adequately addressed, as illustrated by the fact that languages are often too strictly separated or that performance tests are taken exclusively in the dominant language (Breton-Carbonneau, Cleghorn, Evans & Pesco, 2012).

Adams, Bell, Goodman and Joshi (2016) stress that teachers play an essential part in promoting just and fair treatment of all learners in the class. According to Lee and Quijada Cerecer (2010), the success of teaching and learning in classrooms depends primarily on the teacher-learner relationship and whether teachers have been trained and supported in relevant strategies and skills to employ learners' socio-cultural knowledge and meet diverse learners' needs in the classroom.

The research findings confirm that the genuine interest of some of the teachers aid immigrant learners to overcome the challenges they encounter in the educational process. Some participants reported support from other immigrant learners; some from teachers who understood their situations; some had supportive parents who involved themselves in their children's schooling; and most displayed a sense of resilience in their determination to achieve their dreams against all odds. Although there are clear challenges in the execution and implementation of inclusive education, several schools have dedicated teachers who are genuinely committed to inclusion. It was found that some teachers went out of their way to accept and support immigrant learners in their academic endeavours, and this bodes positively for the experience of inclusion by immigrant learners.

The study reveals that when it comes to the quality of instruction in the classroom, learners in public schools are often excluded rather than included. Effective inclusion of immigrant learners in the South African education system is still a challenge and especially, it seems, in public schools. If findings from the immigrant learners attending the private and public school can be generalised as relevant to all private schools and all public schools in South Africa, the strategies of implementing inclusive education are vastly different between these two types of schools, highlighting a real lack of commitment regarding service delivery in the public-school sector.

The research reveals that levels of exclusion of immigrant learners exist as they try to fit into the South African education system, with minimum involvement from teachers in helping them in the public school. This contributed to immigrant learners experiencing more challenges in their schooling journey.

Participant 2 said:

I was refused in many schools because ... I did not speak the language of this country. When I came here, I had ... passed grade 7 and I was ... told to repeat because ... I did not know. I was hurt ... but I did grade 7 again.

The evidence above shows that some teachers neglected to aid them as they met challenges in their learning due to language barriers. Inclusive education aims to offer a platform to all learners in schools, regardless of their differences. The findings do not reveal that effective application of inclusive education is a reality, especially in public schools. It seems that public schools still experience difficulties in implementing inclusive education in overcrowded classes with fewer learning support materials or often nothing at all to assist teachers.

Conclusion

The research largely generated data that support existing literature on immigrant learners' experiences of schooling in a host country and sheds additional light on understanding the successes and challenges that immigrant learners experience while receiving schooling in South Africa. On a broader scale, it makes a further contribution towards understanding the complexities and context-specific obstacles that appear in South Africa's journey of implementing the national policy on inclusive education in schools.

Other issues that emerged from the findings are that of the language of teaching and learning. If immigrant learners are not familiar with the language used in schools, they will feel sidelined, and this will manifest as a barrier to their successful learning. The findings reveal that some teachers were easily annoyed with learners because of language barriers, and the participants felt neglected and not understood by the teachers. The language issue highlights the ineffectiveness of real inclusion in such circumstances.

Teachers hold the key to the successful implementation of inclusive education as they are at the front line of addressing inequalities in the classrooms. While I have been saddened by the barriers to learning, development and participation that characterise the participants' schooling experience in South Africa, I have been happily reminded of the resilience of most immigrant learners in their determination to succeed academically and to find a place of belonging in their host country. This speaks of the resilience of the human spirit when facing huge life challenges.

My recommendations based on the findings of this research include the following:

- African languages should be included in the curriculum to avoid the weight that immigrant learners bear due to language barriers.
- Every teacher at school should embrace diversity to make equal education a reality.
- More research is needed on both the immigrant learners and the teachers so that future findings can contribute to the effective inclusion of these learners.
- Support and funding are necessary constituents of effective implementation of inclusive education.

Implementing these recommendations may lead to developing a better understanding of how immigrant learners find ways of successfully navigating their schooling in a foreign country and, make inclusion a reality for these learners.

Authors' Contributions
ZN conducted the research and undertook the analysis. Both ZA and AD compiled the rest of the paper. AD reviewed the paper.

References
Adams M, Bell LA, Goodman DJ & Joshi KY (eds.) 2016. *Teaching for diversity and social justice* (3rd ed). New York, NY: Routledge.

Ainscow M 2019. *The UNESCO Salamanca Statement 25 years on developing inclusive and equitable education systems*. Discussion paper prepared for the International Forum on inclusion and equity in education – every learner matters, Cali, Colombia, 11–13 September. Available at https://en.unesco.org/sites/default/files/2019-forum-inclusion-discussion-paper-en.pdf. Accessed 4 October 2024.

Amor AM, Hagiwara M, Shogren KA, Thompson JR, Verdugo MÁ, Burke KM & Aguayo V 2019. International perspectives and trends in research on inclusive education: A systematic review. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 23(12):1277–1295. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2018.1445304

Banks JA 2008. Diversity, group identity, and citizenship education in a global age. *Educational Researcher*, 37(3):129–139. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X08317501

Begeny JC & Martens BK 2007. Inclusionary education in Italy: A literature review and call for more empirical research. *Remedial and Special Education*, 28(2):80–94. https://doi.org/10.1177/07419325070280020701

Berry LE 2016. The research relationship in narrative enquiry. *Nurse Researcher*, 24(1):10–14. https://doi.org/10.778/nr.2016e1430

Betts A 2015. Human migration will be a defining issue of this century: How best to cope? *The Guardian*, 20 September. Available at https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/sep/20/migrants-refugees-asylum-seekers-21st-century-trend. Accessed 6 October 2024.

Breton-Carbonneau G, Cleghorn A, Evans R & Pesco D 2012. Pedagogical and political encounters in linguistically and culturally diverse primary classrooms: Examples from Quebec, Canada, and Gauteng, South Africa. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 42(3):373–391. https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2011.650870

Causton-Theoharis J & Theoharis G 2008. Creating inclusive schools for all students. *School Administrator*, 65(8):24–25.

Clandinin DJ 2006. Narrative inquiry: A methodology for studying lived experience. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 27(1):44–54. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X060270010301

Clandinin DJ (ed.) 2007. *Handbook of narrative inquiry:*

Mapping a methodology. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452226552

Clandinin DJ 2013. *Engaging in narrative inquiry*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press.

Crul M, Lelie F, Keshiner E, Schneider J & Biner Ö 2019. Lost in transit: Education for refugee children in Sweden, Germany, and Turkey. In MM Suárez-Orozco (ed). *Humanitarianism and mass migration: Confronting the world crisis*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.

Crush J & Tawodzera G 2014. Exclusion and discrimination: Zimbabwean migrant children and South African schools. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 15:677–693. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-013-0283-7

D'amant A 2010. Teachers in transition: Becoming inclusive practitioners. PhD thesis. Durban, South Africa: University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Denzin NK & Lincoln YS (eds.) 1994. *Handbook of qualitative research*. London, England: Sage.

Department of Education 2001. *Education White Paper 6: Special needs education. Building an inclusive education and training system*. Pretoria, South Africa: Author. Available at http://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileti cket=gVFccZLi/tI=&tabid=191&mid=484. Accessed 2 October 2024.

Dusi P & Steinbach M 2016. Voices of children and parents from elsewhere: A glance at integration in Italian primary schools. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 20(8):816–827. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2015.1111948

Goyol AB 2006. *Adjustment problems of African students at public universities in America*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America.

Hemson C 2011. Fresh grounds: African migrants in a South African primary school. *Southern African Review of Education*, 17:65–85. Available at https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Crispin-Hemson-2/publication/268353784_Fresh_grounds_African_migrants_in_a_South_African_primary_school/lin ks/553fb9ee0cf29680de9d0f0f/Fresh-grounds-African-migrants-in-a-South-African-primary-school.pdf. Accessed 3 October 2024.

Hummel M & Engelbrecht P 2018. Teacher education and notions of diversity in Malawi. In E Walton & R Osman (eds). *Teacher education for diversity: Conversations from the global South*. London, England: Routledge.

Ibrahim HA, Shafaatu MHD & Yabo NU 2017. English as a medium of instruction: Challenges to Nigerian primary schools. *The Victorian*, 5(2):63–72.

International Data Alliance for Children on the Move 2021. *Missing from the story: The urgent need for better data to protect children on the move*. Available at https://data.unicef.org/resources/idac-data-insight-1/#:~:text=Today%2C%20more%20girls%20and%20boys%20are%20on%20the,across%20them%2C%20mostly%20due%20to%20conflict%20and%20violence. Accessed 2 October 2024.

Kamanga C 2013. JET's approach to teacher development. In G Khosa (ed). *Systemic school improvement interventions in South Africa: Some practical lessons from development practitioners*.

Somerset West, South Africa: African Minds.

Kang'ethe SM & Duma V 2013. Exploring dimensions of post-apartheid xenophobic sentiments towards African immigrants in South Africa. *Insight on Africa*, 5(2):157–168. https://doi.org/10.1177/0975087813512062

Kenny K 2009. *Visual communication research designs*. London, England: Routledge.

Koehler C 2017. *Continuity of learning for newly arrived refugee children in Europe. NESET II ad hoc question No. 1/2017*. Available at https://nesetweb.eu/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/Continuity-of-learning-for-newly-arrived-refugee-children-in-Europe.pdf. Accessed 1 January 2017.

Koehler C & Schneider J 2019. Young refugees in education: The particular challenges of school systems in Europe. *Comparative Migration Studies*, 7:28. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-019-0129-3

Lee TS & Quijada Cerecer PD 2010. (Re) claiming native youth knowledge: Engaging in socio-culturally responsive teaching and relationships. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 12(4):199–205. https://doi.org/10.1080/15210960.2010.527586

Liu HY 2016. Economic immigrant parents' educational involvement in Prince Edward Island. MEd thesis. Charlottetown, Canada: University of Prince Edward Island. Available at https://islandscholar.ca/islandora/object/ir:21172/d atastream/PDF. Accessed 16 February 2022.

Mayring P 2000. *Qualitative inhaltsanalyse. Grundlagen und techniken* [Qualitative content analysis: Basics and techniques] (7th ed). Weinheim, Germany: Deutscher Studien Verlag.

McMillan JH & Schumacher S 2010. *Research in education: A conceptual introduction*. New York, NY: Longman.

Meda L, Sookrajh R & Maharaj B 2012. Refugee children in South Africa: Access and challenges to achieving universal primary education. *Africa Education Review*, 9(Suppl. 1):S152–S168. https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2012.755287

Merriam SB 1998. *Qualitative research and case study applications in education* (2nd ed). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam SB 2009. *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Morcom VE & MacCallum JA 2012. Getting personal about values: Scaffolding student participation towards an inclusive classroom community. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 16(12):1323–1334. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2011.572189

Muthukrishna M 2010. Modeling a smart home: Prospective evaluation of smart domestic technologies. Honours dissertation. Brisbane, Australia: University of Queensland.

Ngema ZA 2014. The geographies of the schooling experiences of immigrant children at a primary school in KwaZulu-Natal. MEd dissertation. Durban, South Africa: University of KwaZulu-Natal. Available at https://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za/server/api/core/bit streams/ad395dc6-b293-41ec-8613-

ba8ec033ede0/content. Accessed 2 October 2024.

Nnadozie OU 2010. *Why poverty in Africa*. Nsukka, Nigeria: Bel's Book.

Ntombela S 2010. Towards inclusive education and training: Developing the South African system for the challenges of change. *Journal of Educational Studies*, 9(1):69–81.

Ntombela S 2011. The progress of inclusive education in South Africa: Teachers' experiences in a selected district, KwaZulu-Natal. *Improving Schools*, 14(1):5–14. https://doi.org/10.1177/1365480210390082

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2016. *International migration outlook 2016*. Paris, France: OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/migr_outlook-2016-en

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2017. *Educational opportunity for all: Overcoming inequality throughout the life course*. Paris, France: OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264287457-en

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2018. *Equity in education: Breaking down barriers to social mobility, PISA*. Paris, France: OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264073234-en

Osman R 2009. The phenomenon of xenophobia as experienced by immigrant learners in inner city schools of Johannesburg. MEd dissertation. Pretoria, South Africa: University of South Africa. Available at https://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/3203/dissertation_osman_r.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y. Accessed 2 October 2024.

Perumal J 2015. Responding with hospitality: Refugee children in the South African education system. *Education as Change*, 19(3):65–90. https://doi.org/10.1080/16823206.2015.1085622

Pinson H, Arnot M & Candappa M 2010. *Education, asylum and the 'non-citizen' child: The politics of compassion and belonging*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Preece J 2006. Education for inclusion. *Convergence*, 39(2-3):147–165.

Punch S & Tisdall EKM 2012. Exploring children and young people's relationships across Majority and Minority Worlds. *Children's Geographies*, 10(3):241–248. https://doi.org/10.1080/14733285.2012.693375

Ruedin D 2019. Attitudes to immigrants in South Africa: Personality and vulnerability. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 45(7):1108–1126. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1428086

Schleicher A & Zoido P 2016. The policies that shaped PISA, and the policies that PISA shaped. In K Mundy, A Green, B Lingard & A Verger (eds). *The handbook of global education policy*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Schmidt MJ & Mestry R 2019. Through the looking glass: An intersectional lens of South African education policy. In O Hankivsky & JS Jordan-Zachery (eds). *The Palgrave handbook of intersectionality in public policy*. Basingstoke, England: Palgrave Macmillan.

Schwandt TA 1994. Constructivist, interpretivist approaches to human inquiry. In NK Denzin & YS Lincoln (eds). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Shaddock AJ, Nielsen TW, Giorcelli L, Kilham C & Hoffman-Raap L 2007. What are the critical factors in ensuring successful collaboration between mainstream teachers and teaching assistants? In A Shaddock, B Smyth King & L Giorcelli (eds). *A project to improve the learning outcomes of students with disabilities in the early, middle and post compulsory years of schooling* (Pt. 1). Canberra, Australia: Commonwealth of Australia. Available at https://webarchive.nla.gov.au/awa/20071019045532/http://pandora.nla.gov.au/pan/78123/20071019-1322/www.dest.gov.au/sectors/school_education/publications_resources/profiles/report.pdf. Accessed 19 November 2024.

Spencer S 2011. *Visual research methods in the social sciences: Awakening visions*. Abingdon, England: Routledge.

Strauss A & Corbin J 1990. *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Suárez-Orozco M & Suárez-Orozco C 2015. Children of immigration. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 97(4):8–14. https://doi.org/10.1177/0031721715619911

Teaching for All 2019. *Inclusive teaching and learning for South Africa. Unit 2: Learner diversity*. Parklands, South Africa: British Council. Available at https://www.britishcouncil.org.za/sites/default/files/t4a_hei_study_guide_unit_2_-_learner_diversity.pdf. Accessed 16 April 2020.

United Nations Children's Fund 2012. *Inequalities in early childhood development: What the data say: Evidence from the multiple indicator cluster surveys*. New York, NY: Author. Available at https://www.unicef.org/sites/default/files/press-releases/media-Inequities_in_Early_Childhood_Development_LoRes_PDF_EN_02082012%281%29.pdf. Accessed 7 October 2024.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization 2015. *Education for all 2000-2015: Achievements and challenges*. Paris, France: Author. https://doi.org/10.54676/LBSF6974

Verma GK & Mallick K 1999. *Researching education: Perspectives and techniques*. Philadelphia, PA: Falmer Press.

Voltz DL, Sims MJ & Nelson B 2010. *Connecting teachers, students and standards: Strategies for success in diverse and inclusive classrooms*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.

Whitaker BE 2017. Migration within Africa and beyond. *African Studies Review*, 60(2):209–220. https://doi.org/10.1017/asr.2017.49